

Dr. Ell's Response

TO THE EDITOR:

The main point of Dr. Arnold's letter rests on an apparent ambiguity in my text. In the sentence preceding the one he quotes, I stated that no single sign or symptom was diagnostic of leprosy. I did add, however, that certain combinations of signs and symptoms can be. I then mentioned the three signs Dr. Arnold discusses. At no point did I suggest that each was unique to leprosy.

I stand corrected on the choice of the term "autoamputation." It is certainly correct that digital autoamputation is not a feature of leprosy in a strict sense. On the other hand, I was discussing a period during which the effects of secondary infections were not separated (indeed conceptually they could not be) from those of leprosy itself. I do not think that there is any serious question as to whether or not digits were lost in this way during the Middle Ages. Nonetheless, I do regret the use of the term "autoamputation"

even in that context. The term is not a literal translation of any medieval text, so the blame is mine.

Dr. Arnold's comments on tuberculosis and syphilis in the Middle Ages cannot be substantiated from extant evidence. They are popular and reasonable assertions, but nothing more. The question of when syphilis arrived in Europe remains unanswered and essentially nothing is known of TB during the medieval period. According to standard medieval definitions of tuberculosis, entities such as gastrointestinal or renal tuberculosis were excluded and any disease that produced a cavity lung lesion was tuberculosis. The study of physical remains has added nothing of importance. In the absence of any evidence, I cannot reply to the content of these claims, even though Dr. Arnold states them as if they were facts.

The term *wertlich*, also spelled *wertlich* in the text in question, does not represent

a typographical error. Medieval and modern German differ. I would also point out that spelling was not standardized in the Middle Ages. Even at a much later date, Sir Walter Raleigh is known to have spelled his own name over 20 different ways.

—Stephen R. Ell, M.D., Ph.D.

*Department of Radiology
The University of Chicago
5841 South Maryland Avenue
Chicago, Illinois 60637, U.S.A.*